

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

WHITE STALLION ENERGY CENTER, LLC, ET AL.,	{	No. 12-1100 (and consolidated cases)
Petitioners,		
v.	{	
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,		
Respondent.	}	

**JOINT RESPONSE OF STATE, INDUSTRY, AND LABOR PETITIONERS
TO ENVIRONMENTAL PETITIONERS' MOTION FOR
RECONSIDERATION OF WORD LIMITS**

The Mercury and Air Toxics Standards Rule (“MATS Rule”), 77 Fed. Reg. 9304 (Feb. 16, 2012), is among the most complex Clean Air Act (“CAA”) rules to be litigated in terms of the multitude of issues raised¹ and parties involved.² This

¹ State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners raised 153 issues in their non-binding statements of issues. State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners’ Proposed Briefing Format and Schedule at 9 (Doc. 1377899).

Environmental Petitioners raised five issues. Environmental Petitioners’ Non-Binding Statement of Issues (Doc. 1375733).

² There are four Environmental Petitioners in the MATS Rule litigation: Chesapeake Climate Action Network; Conservation Law Foundation; Environmental Integrity Project; and Sierra Club.

There are 23 State Petitioners joining this response: the States of Michigan; Alabama; Alaska; Arizona; Arkansas; Florida; Idaho; Indiana; Kansas;

litigation is the result of more than 20 years of hazardous air pollutant rulemaking that has amassed the largest and most complex record ever under CAA § 112.

The Court set the briefing schedule and format for this case in an August 24, 2012 order (Doc. 1391295). In that order, *all* parties were allocated fewer words than requested for their respective briefs. For example, Environmental Petitioners requested 11,000 words to address issues in their main brief and received 6,000 words, 54.5% of their request. Similarly, State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners requested 28,000 words to address issues in their main opening briefs and received 15,000 words, 53.6% of their request. Petitioners believe that the word allocations in the Court's briefing order compromise their ability to present the numerous issues raised by EPA's action, and are therefore in some tension with the

Mississippi; Nebraska; North Dakota; Ohio; Oklahoma; South Carolina; Texas; Utah; West Virginia; Wyoming; the Commonwealths of Pennsylvania and Virginia; Terry E. Branstad, the Governor of Iowa, on behalf of the people of Iowa; and Jack Conway, Attorney General of Kentucky.

The following Industry and Labor Petitioners join this response: National Mining Association; National Black Chamber of Commerce and Institute for Liberty; Utility Air Regulatory Group; Midwest Ozone Group; American Public Power Association; Peabody Energy Corporation; West Virginia Chamber of Commerce *et al.*; United Mine Workers of America; Kansas City Board of Public Utilities; Puerto Rico Electric Power Authority; Chase Power Development, LLC; FirstEnergy Generation Corporation; Edgecombe Genco, LLC and Spruance Genco, LLC; and Wolverine Power Supply Cooperative, Inc.

procedural and substantive guarantees of the Clean Air Act, Administrative Procedure Act, and Due Process Clause of the Fifth Amendment.

Any reconsideration of this Court's briefing order should result in an enlargement in the words allocated to all briefs. Any increase in the length of State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners' briefs should at a minimum be proportional to any enlargement of Environmental Petitioners' opening brief given the fact that Environmental Petitioners raised only five issues while State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners raised 153 issues. *See supra* note 1. If Environmental Petitioners' opening brief were increased in length from 6,000 to 8,000 words -- an increase of 33.3%, the word allocation for State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners' main opening brief(s) should be increased to at least 20,000 words. Commensurate increases should be made to the length of other briefs.

Dated: September 11, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ F. William Brownell

F. William Brownell

Lee B. Zeugin

Elizabeth L. Horner (admitted in VA)

HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP

2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20037

(202) 955-1500

bbrownell@hunton.com

Counsel for Utility Air Regulatory Group

/s/ Neil D. Gordon

Bill Schuette

Attorney General

John J. Bursch

Solicitor General

S. Peter Manning

Neil D. Gordon

Brian J. Negele

Assistant Attorneys General

Environment, Natural Resources, and Agriculture Division

Office of the Attorney General of

Michigan
525 W. Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30755
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 373-7540
manningp@michigan.gov
gordonnl@michigan.gov
negeleb@michigan.gov

Counsel for the State of Michigan

/s/ Peter S. Glaser
Peter S. Glaser
George Y. Sugiyama
Michael H. Higgins
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP
401 Ninth Street, N.W.
Suite 1000
Washington, D.C. 20004
(202) 274-2998
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

/s/ Luther Strange
Luther Strange
Attorney General
State of Alabama
Office of the Attorney General
501 Washington Avenue
Montgomery, AL 36130
(334) 242-7445

Counsel for the State of Alabama

*Counsel for National Mining
Association*

/s/ David B. Rivkin, Jr.

David B. Rivkin, Jr.
Lee A. Casey
Mark W. DeLaquil
Andrew M. Grossman
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP
Washington Square, Suite 1100
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036-5304
(202) 861-1500
drivkin@bakerlaw.com
lcasey@bakerlaw.com
mdelaquil@bakerlaw.com
agrossman@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for National Black Chamber of
Commerce and Institute for Liberty*

/s/ David M. Flannery

David M. Flannery
Gale Lea Rubrecht
Kathy G. Beckett
Edward L. Kropp
JACKSON KELLY PLLC
500 Lee Street, East, Suite 1600
P.O. Box 553
Charleston, WV 25322-553
(304) 340-1000
dmflannery@jacksonkelly.com
galelea@jacksonkelly.com
kbeckett@jacksonkelly.com
skropp@jacksonkelly.com

Counsel for Midwest Ozone Group

/s/ Steven E. Mulder

Michael C. Geraghty
Attorney General
Steven E. Mulder
State of Alaska
1031 W. 4th Avenue, Suite 200
Anchorage, AK 99501-1994

Counsel for the State of Alaska

/s/ Joseph P. Mikitish

Thomas Horne
Arizona Attorney General
Joseph P. Mikitish
James T. Skardon
Assistant Attorneys General
Environmental Enforcement Section
1275 West Washington
Phoenix, AZ 85007
(602) 542-8553
Joseph.mikitish@azag.gov

Counsel for the State of Arizona

/s/ Leslie Sue Ritts

Leslie Sue Ritts
RITTS LAW GROUP, PLLC
The Carriage House
620 Fort Williams Parkway
Alexandria, VA 22304
(703) 823-2292
LSRitts@rittlawgroup.com

Counsel for American Public Power Association

/s/ Kendra Akin Jones

Dustin McDaniel
Arkansas Attorney General
Kendra Akin Jones
Assistant Attorney General
Charles L. Moulton
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Arkansas Attorney General
323 Center Street, Suite 400
Little Rock, AR 72201
(501) 682-2007
kendra.jones@arkansasag.gov
charles.moulton@arkansasag.gov

Counsel for the State of Arkansas, ex rel. Dustin McDaniel, Attorney General

/s/ Peter S. Glaser

Peter S. Glaser
George Y. Sugiyama
Michael H. Higgins
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP
401 Ninth Street, N.W.
Suite 1000
Washington, D.C. 20001
(202) 274-2998
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

Counsel for Peabody Energy Corporation

/s/ Jonathan A. Glogau

Pamela Jo Bondi
Attorney General of Florida
Jonathan A. Glogau
The Capitol, PL-01
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

Counsel for the State of Florida

/s/ David M. Flannery

David M. Flannery
Gale Lea Rubrecht
Kathy G. Beckett
Edward L. Kropp
JACKSON KELLY PLLC
500 Lee Street, East, Suite 1600
P.O. Box 553
Charleston, WV 25322-553
(304) 340-1000
dmflannery@jacksonkelly.com
galelea@jacksonkelly.com
kbeckett@jacksonkelly.com
skropp@jacksonkelly.com

/s/ Lawrence G. Wasden

Lawrence G. Wasden
Idaho Attorney General
PO Box 83720
Boise, ID 83720-0010

Counsel for the State of Idaho

Counsel for West Virginia Chamber of Commerce, Inc., Georgia Association of Manufacturers, Inc., Indiana Chamber of Commerce, Inc., Indiana Coal Council, Inc., Kentucky Chamber of Commerce, Inc., Kentucky Coal Association, Inc., North Carolina Chamber, Ohio Chamber of Commerce, Pennsylvania Coal Association, South Carolina Chamber of Commerce, The Virginia Chamber of Commerce, The Virginia Coal Association, Incorporated, West Virginia Chamber of Commerce, West Virginia Coal Association, Inc., and Wisconsin Industrial Energy Group, Inc.

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko
Grant Crandall
Arthur Traynor, III
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive
Suite 200
Triangle, VA 22172
(703) 291-2457
gcrandall@umwa.org
atraynor@umwa.org

Eugene M. Trisko
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO
PO Box 47
Glenwood, MD 21738
(301) 639-5238
emtrisko@earthlink.net

Counsel for United Mine Workers of America

/s/ Valerie Tachtiris
Gregory F. Zoeller
Indiana Attorney General
Valerie Tachtiris
Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
IGC-South, Fifth Floor
302 West Washington St.
Indianapolis, IN 46204
(317) 232-6290
Valerie.Tachtiris@atg.in.gov

Counsel for the State of Indiana

/s/ Dennis Lane

Dennis Lane
STINSON MORRISON HECKER LLP
1775 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.,
Suite 800
Washington, D.C. 20006-4605
(202) 785-9100
dlane@stinson.com

Parthenia B. Evans
STINSON MORRISON HECKER LLP
1201 Walnut Street, Suite 2900
Kansas City, Missouri 64106
(816) 842-8600
pevans@stinson.com

*Counsel for Kansas City Board of
Public Utilities*

/s/ John C. Hayes, Jr.

Scott M. Turner
John C. Hayes, Jr.
NIXON PEABODY LLP
401 Ninth Street N.W.
Suite 900
Washington, D.C. 20004
(202) 585-8000
sturner@nixonpeabody.com
jhayes@nixonpeabody.com

*Counsel for Puerto Rico Electric Power
Authority*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay

Derek Schmidt
Attorney General of Kansas
Jeffrey A. Chanay
Deputy Attorney General, Civil
Litigation Division
Office of the Attorney General of
Kansas
120 SW 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor
Topeka, KS 66612-1597
(785) 368-8435
jeff.chanay@ksag.org

Counsel for the State of Kansas

/s/ Harold E. Pizzetta III

Harold E. Pizzetta III
Assistant Attorney General
Director, Civil Litigation Division
550 High Street, Suite 1100
Post Office Box 220
Jackson, MS 39205-0220
(601) 359-3816
hpizz@ago.state.ms.us

Counsel for the State of Mississippi

/s/ John A. Riley

John A. Riley
Christopher C. Thiele
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI LLP
111 Congress Avenue, Ste. 2300
Austin, TX 78701-4061
(512) 542-2108
john.riley@bgllp.com
chris.thiele@bgllp.com

*Counsel for Chase Power Development,
LLC*

/s/ Paul D. Clement

Paul D. Clement
Nathan A. Sales
BANCROFT PLLC
1919 M Street, N.W., Suite 470
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 234-0090
pclement@bancroftpllc.com
nsales@bancroftpllc.com

*Counsel for FirstEnergy Generation
Corporation*

/s/ Katherine J. Spohn

Jon Bruning
Attorney General of the State of
Nebraska
Katherine J. Spohn
Special Counsel to the Attorney General
2115 State Capitol
PO Box 98920
Lincoln, NE 68509
(402) 471-2682
Katie.spohn@nebraska.gov

Counsel for the State of Nebraska

/s/ Margaret I. Olson

Wayne Stenehjem
Attorney General
State of North Dakota
Margaret I. Olson
Assistant Attorney General
Office of Attorney General
500 North 9th Street
Bismarck, ND 58501-4509
(701) 328-3640
maiolson@nd.gov

Counsel for the State of North Dakota

/s/ Lisa Marie Jaeger

Lisa Marie Jaeger
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI LLP
2000 K Street, N.W., Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20006-1872
(202) 828-5800
lisa.jaeger@bgllp.com

*Counsel for Edgecombe Genco, LLC
and Spruance Genco, LLC*

/s/ Dale T. Vitale

Michael DeWine
Attorney General of Ohio
Dale T. Vitale
Gregg H. Bachmann
Cameron F. Simmons
Assistant Attorneys General
Environmental Enforcement Section
30 E. Broad St., 25th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3400
(614) 466-2766
dale.vitale@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Counsel for the State of Ohio

/s/ Steven C. Kohl

Steven C. Kohl
Eugene E. Smary
Sarah C. Lindsey
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700
Southfield, Michigan 48075-1318
(248) 784-5000
skohl@wnj.com

*Counsel for Wolverine Power Supply
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ E. Scott Pruitt

E. Scott Pruitt
Oklahoma Attorney General
P. Clayton Eubanks
Assistant Attorney General
Public Protection Unit/Environment
Office of the Attorney General of
Oklahoma
313 N.E. 21st Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73105
(405) 522-8992
fc.docket@oag.ok.gov
clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov

Counsel for the State of Oklahoma

/s/ Robert M. Wolff

Steven S. Aichele
General Counsel
Robert M. Wolff
Special Counsel
Gregory E. Dunlap
Deputy General Counsel
Office of General Counsel
333 Market Street, 17th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17120
(717) 783-6563

*Counsel for the Commonwealth of
Pennsylvania*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.

Alan Wilson
Attorney General
James Emory Smith, Jr.
Assistant Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 11549
Columbia, SC 29211
(803) 734-3680
agesmith@scag.gov

Counsel for the State of South Carolina

/s/ Mark Walters

Greg Abbott
Attorney General of Texas
Daniel T. Hodge
First Assistant Attorney General
John B. Scott
Deputy Attorney General for Civil
Litigation
Jon Niermann
Chief, Environmental Protection
Division
Mark Walters
Assistant Attorney General
Mary E. Smith
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
Environmental Protection Division
P. O. Box 12548, Capitol Station
Austin, TX 78711-2548
(512) 463-2012
Mark.Walters@oag.state.tx.us
Mary.Smith@oag.state.tx.us

/s/ Mark L. Shurtleff

Mark L. Shurtleff
Utah Attorney General
350 North State Street, #230
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320
(801) 538-1191

Counsel for the State of Utah

*Counsel for the State of Texas, Texas
Commission on Environmental Quality,
Texas Public Utility Commission, and
Railroad Commission of Texas*

/s/ Kenneth T. Cuccinelli, II

Kenneth T. Cuccinelli, II
Attorney General of Virginia
900 East Main Street
Richmond, VA 23219
(804) 786-7240

Counsel for the Commonwealth of Virginia

/s/ Jay A. Jerde

Gregory A. Phillips
Wyoming Attorney General
Jay A. Jerde
Wyoming Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of Wyoming
123 State Capitol
Cheyenne, WY 82002
(307) 777-7841
jay.jerde@wyo.gov

Counsel for the State of Wyoming

/s/ Jack Conway

Jack Conway
Attorney General of Kentucky
700 Capital Avenue, Suite 118
Frankfort, KY 40601

Counsel for Jack Conway, Attorney General of Kentucky

/s/ Silas B. Taylor

Silas B. Taylor
Senior Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of West Virginia
State Capitol, Room 26-E
Charleston, WV 25305
silastaylor@yahoo.com

Counsel for the State of West Virginia

/s/ Brenna Findley

Brenna Findley
1007 East Grand Avenue
Des Moines, IA 50319
brenna.findley@iowa.gov

*Counsel for Terry E. Branstad,
Governor of the State of Iowa on behalf
of the People of Iowa*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that, on this 11th day of September 2012, a copy of the Joint Response of State, Industry, and Labor Petitioners to Environmental Petitioners' Motion for Reconsideration of Word Limits was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all ECF-registered counsel.

/s/ F. William Brownell